

IJMRRS

International Journal for Multidisciplinary Research, Review and Studies

ISSN: 3049-124X

Volume 1 - Issue 2

2024

© 2024 International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research Review and Studies

Navigating Margins: Intersectional Barriers to Electoral Inclusivity and Political Empowerment of Marginalized Women in Indian Democracy.

(A Case Study of Women Sex Workers of Sonagachi)

Sreeja Mukherjee

Author's Details:

Sreeja Mukherjee.

I am an aspiring public policy and electoral management professional, with a distinctive blend of applied mathematics and social science expertise. Holding a Masters in Applied Mathematics from IIEST, Shibpur and pursuing a Masters in International Electoral Management and Practices at TISS, Mumbai, I bring a multidisciplinary approach to democratic processes and inclusive governance. My strengths in policy analysis, statistical modeling, research methodologies, and gender studies, coupled with proficiency in C/C++, Excel, and Power BI, drive my mission to strengthen democratic systems through data driven inclusive policy frameworks.

Abstract.

Despite India's commitment to universal adult franchise, women sex workers face significant barriers to electoral participation, perpetuating their political marginalization and exclusion from democratic processes. While existing literature addresses the electoral exclusion of marginalized communities broadly, there is limited research specifically examining the intersectional barriers faced by women sex workers in exercising their fundamental right to political participation.

This study investigates electoral inclusivity and intersectional vulnerabilities of women sex workers in two prominent red-light districts of Sonagachi, India. Specifically, it examines how gender intersects with occupational vulnerability to impact their electoral participation and representation in democratic processes.

Using a mixed-methods approach, the study combines quantitative surveys and questionnaires with qualitative in-depth interviews and focus groups involving sex workers, policymakers, and stakeholders. The research explores five key themes: socio-economic context, health and safety, access to justice and governance, social identity and discrimination, and empowerment and inclusion.

The study hypothesizes that limited awareness and lack of identification documentation are primary barriers to electoral participation among women sex workers. Building on this finding, the research proposes targeted interventions to enhance electoral awareness and improve access to documentation through community engagement and collaborative efforts between NGOs, government agencies, and community leaders.

The findings will contribute to a theoretical understanding of intersectional vulnerabilities in democratic participation and practical policy reforms needed to promote inclusive democracy. This research will have important implications for policymakers, NGOs, and stakeholders working to protect sex workers' rights and ensure equitable citizenship in India's democracy.

Keywords:

Electoral Inclusivity, Women sex workers, Intersectional vulnerability, Political participation, Democratic processes, Mixed-methods Research, Sonagachi, Gender discrimination, Electoral barriers, Community engagement, India, Marginalized communities.

Introduction.

Democracy's fundamental promise of equal participation and representation remains unfulfilled for many marginalized communities, particularly women sex workers in India. While the adoption of universal adult franchise at independence marked a significant milestone, the intersectionality of gender, caste, class, and occupation continues to create complex barriers to political participation. Despite constituting a significant population, women sex workers face unique challenges stemming from societal stigma, violence, and limited access to essential resources, rendering their voices largely unheard in electoral processes.

The principles of electoral inclusivity are critical to democratic societies, ensuring all citizens have an equal voice in governance. However, existing research has inadequately addressed the specific experiences and challenges faced by women sex workers in exercising their democratic rights. This gap in literature perpetuates their exclusion from political discourse and decision-making processes, despite evidence suggesting that increased representation of marginalized communities leads to more inclusive policies and better societal outcomes.

This research employs a mixed-method approach, combining surveys, interviews, and ethnographic studies to examine the intersectional vulnerabilities faced by women sex workers in India's electoral system. By analyzing historical contexts of women's exclusion from democracy and applying a feminist lens to electoral inclusivity, this study aims to amplify the voices of women sex workers and identify strategies for their meaningful political participation.

Through a comprehensive examination of policy gaps and stakeholder perspectives, this research seeks to contribute to the development of more inclusive democratic practices. The findings will inform policymakers, NGOs, and other stakeholders in their efforts to promote electoral inclusivity and representation. Ultimately, this study aspires to advance the empowerment of women sex workers through increased political participation, contributing to the broader goal of creating a more equitable and just democratic society.

Rationale of the study:

This study seeks to investigate the intersection of sex work and electoral inclusivity in India, a critical yet underexplored area of research. Despite the significant presence of sex workers in India, their electoral participation and political representation remain marginal. This study aims to address the knowledge gap by examining the barriers to electoral inclusivity faced by sex workers, the role of societal stigma, and the impact of legal and policy frameworks on their political participation.

The significance and expected contributions of this study:

1. Filling the knowledge gap on the intersection of sex work and electoral politics in India.

2. A deeper understanding of the barriers to electoral inclusivity faced by sex workers in India.

3. Insights into the role of societal stigma in shaping the political participation of sex workers.

4. Recommendations for policy reforms that promote electoral inclusivity and protect the rights of sex workers.

5. Contributing to the broader discourse on gender, sexuality, and political participation.

6. Empowering sex workers by amplifying their voices and experiences in the political sphere.

This research is relevant in the Indian context, where sex workers face multiple forms of marginalization and exclusion. By exploring the intersection of sex work and electoral inclusivity, this study can help address the practical needs of sex workers and contribute to a more inclusive and equitable society. By conducting this research, we can work towards creating a more inclusive and equitable society where the voices and experiences of sex workers are valued and recognized.

Methodology & Design.

This research employs a comprehensive mixed-methods approach to examine the intersection of sex work and electoral inclusivity in India, integrating both quantitative and qualitative methodologies for a thorough analysis. The quantitative component involves administering surveys and questionnaires to women sex workers, focusing on demographics, electoral participation, and political engagement. This data will be analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics to identify significant patterns and correlations. The qualitative aspect encompasses in-depth interviews with sex workers, policymakers, and stakeholders, complemented by focus group discussions, social mapping, and ethnographic studies to gather rich, contextual insights into their experiences.

The study is structured around five key thematic areas: socio-economic context, examining status, occupation, and education; health, safety, and wellbeing; access to justice and governance; social identity and discrimination; and empowerment and inclusion as a cross-

cutting theme. The sampling strategy combines purposive and snowball sampling techniques, recognizing the challenges in reaching this marginalized population. This approach helps build trust while ensuring representation across different subgroups of sex workers.

Data collection draws from both primary and secondary sources. Primary data comes directly from participant interactions, while secondary sources include academic literature, government reports, and NGO documentation. The analysis integrates statistical tools for quantitative data with thematic analysis for qualitative information, ensuring triangulation and validation of findings. This comprehensive methodology enables researchers to explore both the "what" and "why" aspects of electoral inclusivity among women sex workers, providing valuable insights for policymakers and stakeholders while contributing to the broader understanding of marginalization in democratic processes. The design's strength lies in its ability to capture both broad patterns through numerical data and deep, nuanced understanding through contextual information about the challenges faced by women sex workers in India's electoral system.

Conceptualizing the Topic through Preliminary Literature Review.

A literature review is classified into different thematic areas and presented in the following section.

Understanding Sex Work in the Indian Context:

Sex work in India exists within a complex intersection of historical, social, legal, and economic factors, with practices ranging from traditional devadasi systems to contemporary commercial sex work (Ghosh, 2023). While sex work itself is not criminalized in India, related activities are prohibited under the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act of 1956 (Srivastava & Majhi, 2022).

The demographics of sex workers are diverse, challenging monolithic representations of the industry (Azhar et al., 2020; Dash & Nakkeeran, 2020). Economic factors like poverty and limited employment opportunities often drive individuals into sex work, though research increasingly recognizes the complex decision-making processes involved (Shankar & Sahni, 2021).

Sex workers face significant challenges including social stigma, discrimination, violence, and health concerns such as HIV/AIDS (Ali & Rogers, 2023; Alliance, 2016). These issues create

barriers to healthcare, housing, and education, perpetuating cycles of vulnerability and placing sex workers at the "margins of the state" (Das & Poole, 2007; Seshu, 2021).

Recent years have seen growing activism for sex workers' rights, with organizations advocating for decriminalization, improved working conditions, and access to social services (Kotiswaran, 2019). These movements emphasize the recognition of sex work as labour deserving dignity and rights protections (Amnesty International, 2016; Council of Europe, 2024).

The landmark Supreme Court judgment recognizing sex workers' rights represents a significant step toward acknowledging their citizenship rights (Rao et al., 2022), though policy discussions continue to balance protection against exploitation with respect for autonomy and labour rights.

The Evolution of Indian Democracy and Inclusive Participation:

India's emergence as the world's largest democracy in 1950 marked a historic achievement despite conditions traditionally considered incompatible with democracy (Varshney, 1998). Under Dr. B.R. Ambedkar's leadership, India implemented sophisticated power-sharing arrangements and constitutional protections for minorities (Lijphart, 1996).

Ahuja and Chhibber (2012) identify distinct perceptions of voting rights among marginalized groups, who often view electoral participation as their primary connection to the state—not voting equates to being "dead to the state." Banerjee (2017) notes how election days create rare moments when marginalized citizens assert political equality.

While the Election Commission's initiatives enhance electoral accessibility (Ministry of External Affairs, n.d.), sex workers face significant barriers to effective participation despite universal adult suffrage. These include documentation challenges, stigma, and mobility restrictions.

As India's democracy continues evolving within Dahl's (1971) framework of polyarchy, addressing these barriers is essential for developing inclusive democratic processes that recognize citizenship rights regardless of occupation or social status (Varshney, 2014).

Rights-Based Approach to Sex Workers' Political Participation:

A rights-based approach to sex workers' political participation emphasizes the fundamental human rights and civil liberties that should be afforded to sex workers as equal citizens within democratic societies. This framework is particularly relevant in India, where the constitution guarantees equal rights to all citizens but implementation often falls short for marginalized communities (Varshney, 2014).

Scholars like Bindman and Doezema argue that recognizing sex work as legitimate labour is crucial for ensuring sex workers' political rights and representation. The systematic exclusion of sex workers from political processes undermines their ability to advocate for their interests and influence policies that directly affect their lives, representing a significant democratic deficit (Dahl, 1971).

Overs and Longo highlight how criminalization and stigma create substantial barriers to political participation. When sex work is criminalized, sex workers often cannot safely engage in public advocacy, join labor unions, or participate in formal political processes without risking arrest or discrimination (Van Der Meulen, 2011).

Sullivan and Ditmore contend that a rights-based framework must address intersectional vulnerabilities while recognizing sex workers' agency. Effective political participation requires both the removal of legal barriers and the creation of supportive structures that enable sex workers to organize collectively and engage with political institutions (Van Der Meulen, 2011).

Weitzer's research demonstrates how successful examples of sex worker political participation, particularly in countries like New Zealand and parts of Australia, have led to improved working conditions and better health outcomes. When sex workers are included in policy-making processes, the resulting regulations tend to be more practical, effective, and respectful of human rights (Guha, 2002).

Organizations like the Global Network of Sex Work Projects (NSWP) emphasize the importance of "nothing about us without us"—the principle that sex workers must be centrally involved in any policies or programs affecting their lives. This approach recognizes that sex workers possess crucial experiential knowledge (Lerum & Brents, 2016).

In the Indian context, the fight for sex workers' political participation connects with broader questions about democratic inclusion and citizenship rights. Banerjee (2017) argues that voting behavior among marginalized groups is influenced by complex factors including identity,

patronage networks, and perceptions of state legitimacy—all of which have particular relevance for sex worker communities.

Structural Barriers and Challenges:

Sex workers face numerous structural barriers that significantly impact their lives, operating at multiple intersecting levels of society. These structural constraints fundamentally shape their relationship with the state and political institutions.

From a feminist theoretical lens, scholars like Pheterson and Leigh argue that the criminalization of sex work represents a form of institutionalized gender discrimination, reinforcing patriarchal control over women's bodies and economic choices (Crenshaw, 1991).

Through an intersectional feminist perspective, these structural barriers are compounded by multiple forms of discrimination based on gender, class, race, caste, religion, immigration status, and sexual orientation. Marginalized women, particularly from disadvantaged castes and communities, transgender women, and those in rural areas, often face heightened levels of violence, discrimination, and limited access to legal protection (Locked Out at the Margins, 2020).

Economic theorists point to the structural economic barriers that limit sex workers' options and mobility. Galtung's concept of "structural violence," as applied by researchers like Melissa Farley, explains how economic systems create conditions where some women have limited alternatives for economic survival (Kurup, 2006).

Through a public health lens, researchers highlight how structural barriers create significant health risks for sex workers. Criminalization often forces women to work in unsafe conditions, limits their ability to negotiate safer sex practices, and restricts their access to healthcare services (Srivastava, 2024).

Legal scholars emphasize how criminalization creates a complex web of structural barriers including difficulty accessing housing, inability to report crimes without risking arrest, and challenges in maintaining custody of children. Halley and Kotiswaran demonstrate how legal frameworks often perpetuate rather than alleviate these structural inequalities (Shankar & Sahni, 2021).

Social exclusion theory, as applied by researchers like Sanders, helps explain how stigma and discrimination create barriers to social participation and support. In India, this exclusion is

often reinforced through cultural and religious narratives that simultaneously objectify and stigmatize sex workers (News18, 2019).

For former prisoners who engaged in sex work, the barriers to political participation are particularly acute. Panigrahi and Panigrahi (2023) note that the disenfranchisement of prisoners in India represents a significant democratic deficit that disproportionately affects already marginalized populations.

Social Stigma and Discrimination:

Social stigma and discrimination against sex workers manifest in profound ways across society, affecting their personal lives, professional experiences, and access to basic services including political participation. The concept of "whore stigma," as articulated by Pheterson, describes the deep-rooted social prejudice that marks sex workers as morally corrupt.

In healthcare settings, stigma manifests through discriminatory treatment by medical professionals. Research by Deering has documented how sex workers often face degrading treatment, breaches of confidentiality, and outright denial of services, leading many to avoid seeking necessary medical care (Singh & CWDS, 2022).

Within the criminal justice system, stigma manifests in particularly harmful ways. Law enforcement officers may dismiss reports of violence against sex workers, blame them for victimization, or subject them to harassment. Research by Bernstein has documented how this systemic discrimination contributes to higher rates of violence against sex workers and fosters deep distrust of state institutions (Singh & CWDS, 2022).

The intersection of sex work stigma with other forms of discrimination based on race, gender identity, sexual orientation, and immigration status creates compound layers of marginalization. Koken's research shows that transgender sex workers and sex workers of color often face intensified discrimination and violence. Mukhopadhyay (2006) notes that such intersecting forms of marginalization create complex relationships with the state characterized by simultaneous neglect and over-policing.

Housing discrimination presents another significant challenge, with sex workers often facing eviction or denial of housing when their occupation becomes known. Similarly, financial institutions may close accounts or deny services to known sex workers, limiting their ability to establish financial security (Weitzer, 2009).

The media's portrayal of sex workers often reinforces harmful stereotypes, typically presenting them either as victims without agency or as morally corrupted individuals. This binary representation fails to capture the complex realities of sex workers' lives and experiences (Weitzer, 2009).

Religious and cultural stigma in India adds another layer of complexity, with sex work often viewed through contradictory lenses of ritual significance and moral corruption. The historical connection between certain forms of sex work and religious practices creates complex cultural dynamics that both sanctify and stigmatize sex workers in different contexts (Ghosh, 2023).

Documentation and Identity Issues:

The documentation and identity issues faced by women sex workers represent significant barriers to accessing basic rights and services, including political participation. These challenges are particularly acute in India, where documentation requirements have become increasingly stringent.

Brewis and Linstead argue that the criminalization of sex work creates a complex web of documentation challenges that effectively deny sex workers full citizenship rights. In India, this is exacerbated by identity systems like Aadhaar, which can create additional barriers for marginalized populations (Mukhopadhyay, 2006).

Overs emphasizes how lack of formal identification documents often prevents sex workers from accessing essential services like healthcare, banking, and housing. This documentation gap creates a cycle of exclusion from formal systems and institutions, including electoral processes (Banerjee, 2017).

Research by Ahmed and Seshu demonstrates how the absence of recognized work documentation creates particular challenges. Without formal proof of employment or income, sex workers struggle to open bank accounts, secure loans, or rent apartments. This economic precarity directly impacts political participation (Seshu, 2021).

Agustín's work highlights how documentation issues are particularly acute for migrant sex workers. Irregular migration status, combined with criminalized work, creates situations where workers may lack both identification documents and work permits. In India, internal migration between states creates similar challenges for sex workers who move from their native regions to major cities (Seshu, 2021).

The intersection of gender identity and documentation presents unique challenges for transgender sex workers, as documented by Currah and Mulqueen. In India, despite legal recognition of transgender identities, many transgender sex workers continue to face bureaucratic obstacles in obtaining identity documents that reflect their gender (Azhar et al., 2020).

Weitzer's research shows how documentation issues extend beyond individual identification to affect sex workers' ability to form and register organizations, open business accounts, or engage in formal advocacy. This institutional exclusion limits their ability to organize collectively and advocate for their rights through official channels.

The COVID-19 pandemic highlighted these documentation challenges, with many sex workers unable to access emergency support or healthcare due to lack of formal identification or proof of income. This crisis renewed attention to the urgent need for solutions to these systemic barriers (Seshu, 2021).

Mobility and Access Concerns:

The mobility and access concerns faced by women sex workers are complex and multifaceted, directly impacting their ability to participate in political processes. In India, these challenges are shaped by both physical infrastructure limitations and social barriers.

O'Neill's research emphasizes how criminalization creates significant restrictions on sex workers' freedom of movement. In India, the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act has created geographically restricted zones where sex workers must navigate complex legal landscapes, limiting their physical access to government institutions and political spaces (Srivastava & Majhi, 2022).

Hubbard and Sanders have documented how urban planning and zoning laws often restrict sex workers' access to safe working spaces. In Indian cities, urban development policies often push sex workers from central areas to peripheries, distancing them from administrative centers where political engagement typically occurs (Das et al., 2007).

Day's ethnographic research highlights how mobility restrictions particularly affect streetbased sex workers, who must constantly navigate between the need to be visible to clients and invisible to law enforcement. This constant navigation of visibility and invisibility translates to political participation as well.

Agustín documents how anti-trafficking policies, while well-intentioned, often restrict women's mobility and right to migrate for work. In India, internal migration policies and anti-trafficking initiatives sometimes conflate voluntary sex work with trafficking, creating additional mobility barriers for sex workers who move between states (Shankar & Sahni, 2021).

Kempadoo and Sanghera's research highlights how mobility restrictions disproportionately affect women from marginalized backgrounds. In India, these intersectional factors are compounded by caste hierarchies and regional disparities that further restrict movement and access for many sex workers (Asad, n.d.).

According to Shah's research, economic barriers significantly impact mobility. For many Indian sex workers, particularly those from disadvantaged communities or rural areas, the financial costs of political participation—including transportation to polling stations, time away from work, and childcare—create substantial barriers to engagement (Ahuja & Chhibber, 2012).

Mgbako's research emphasizes how mobility restrictions impact collective organizing. Limited mobility affects sex workers' ability to participate in advocacy efforts, attend meetings, or access legal support services. In India, similar dynamics affect sex workers' participation in collective political action, particularly for those working in isolated or rural areas (NANDINEE BANDYOPADHYAY, n.d.).

Agency and Collective Action Within Sex Worker Communities:

The concept of agency and collective action within sex worker communities emphasizes the importance of recognizing sex workers as active agents rather than passive victims. This perspective is particularly relevant for understanding sex workers' political engagement in India.

Kempadoo's work highlights how sex worker movements have historically demonstrated strong collective agency in fighting for their rights. In India, organizations like SANGRAM, VAMP, and Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee exemplify this tradition of collective agency, developing sophisticated political strategies (Kotiswaran, 2019).

Doezema and Leigh's research emphasizes how sex worker-led organizations have been instrumental in advocating for policy changes and improved working conditions. The term "sex work" itself emerged as a conscious political act to assert worker identity and challenge stigmatizing language. In India, similar linguistic shifts have occurred as sex worker organizations have reclaimed agency through self-definition (Dash & Nakkeeran, 2020).

Ditmore's documentation of sex worker movements shows how collective organizing has led to significant achievements in health services, legal rights, and worker protection. The Sonagachi Project in Kolkata stands as a prominent example, achieving significant improvements in health outcomes and worker conditions through collective action (Weitzer, 2009).

Hardy's work examines how sex workers exercise agency through various forms of resistance and mutual support networks. Workers develop sophisticated strategies for sharing information about dangerous clients, supporting colleagues in crisis, and maintaining safety despite criminalization—demonstrating what Hardy terms "collective resilience" (Lerum & Brents, 2016).

Overs' work on sex worker movements emphasizes the importance of recognizing sex workers' political agency. She documents how sex worker organizations have developed sophisticated political strategies, engaging with international bodies like the UN while maintaining grassroots accountability. Indian sex worker organizations have similarly engaged with international human rights mechanisms while maintaining strong local organizing (Berg, 2014).

Conceptual Framework: Citizenship, Identity, and Justice:

Understanding the political participation of sex workers requires a robust conceptual framework centered on citizenship, identity, and justice. These interconnected concepts provide theoretical grounding for analyzing the complex relationship between sex workers and the democratic process in India.

Marshall's framework conceptualizes citizenship as comprising civil rights, political rights, and social rights. For sex workers in India, these rights are often undermined by criminalization, stigma, and economic marginalization. As Mukhopadhyay (2006) notes, the precarious legal status of sex work creates a form of "partial citizenship" where formal rights exist without the substantive means to access them.

Taylor's concept of the "politics of recognition" emphasizes that full citizenship requires not just legal rights but social recognition of one's identity and dignity. For sex workers, systematic misrecognition and stigmatization undermine their status as equal citizens deserving of respect and inclusion (Ghosh, 2023).

Fraser's dual model of justice, addressing both redistribution (economic justice) and recognition (cultural justice), provides a comprehensive framework for understanding sex workers' political marginalization. Kotiswaran's (2011) research demonstrates how economic and cultural factors intersect to create distinct patterns of vulnerability and agency among different communities of sex workers.

The concept of "acts of citizenship," developed by Isin, offers a dynamic perspective on how marginalized groups claim political recognition through practices that challenge existing boundaries of citizenship. Sex worker activism in India exemplifies such acts, as organizations assert their rights and redefine the boundaries of political participation (SANGRAM, 2018).

Historical Evolution and Contemporary Challenges of Sex Work in India:

The history of sex work in India presents a complex narrative spanning ancient times to the modern era. According to Ghosh (2023), ancient India recognized prostitutes as autonomous social agents who influenced society. During the Mughal period, tawaifs emerged as accomplished courtesans, while the devadasi system in South India represented women dedicated to temple service.

The British colonial era marked a significant shift, implementing legislative measures like the Contagious Diseases Act of 1864 that stigmatized these communities (Kurup, 2006). Colonial authorities introduced regulatory frameworks that fundamentally altered the social status of sex workers and continues to influence contemporary policy approaches.

In contemporary India, Srivastava (2024) highlights the paradoxical "consent to the lack of consent" phenomenon, where sex workers often enter coercive contracts due to socio-economic vulnerabilities. Despite these challenges, community organizing has emerged as a powerful force for change, exemplified by organizations like the Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC) (Time Capsule, 2023).

The Supreme Court's recent recognition of sex workers' rights (Rao et al., 2022) marks a significant legal milestone, though challenges persist in translating these legal victories into meaningful political participation.

Legal Frameworks and Rights Protection in Sex Work: A Global Perspective:

Shankar and Sahni (2021) emphasize how state policies often overlook fundamental socioeconomic challenges that lead women into sex work, while Berg (2014) explores the intricate relationship between labor, identity, and activism within the industry.

Srivastava and Majhi (2022) critique the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act's limitations, highlighting how it perpetuates stigma and fails to address broader trafficking issues. Van der Meulen (2011) advocates for action research that includes sex workers' voices in policy discussions.

The Working Group on Discrimination against Women and Girls (2023) documents widespread discrimination against sex workers globally. Amnesty International's framework (2016) emphasizes protecting sex workers' rights through decriminalization, while addressing discrimination and ensuring access to essential services.

The Supreme Court of India's recent ruling (Rao et al., 2022) recognizing sex work as a legitimate profession marks a significant milestone in dismantling stigma and advocating for enhanced legal protections.

Paradigm Shifts in Understanding Sex Work:

Kuhn's theory of paradigm shifts offers a valuable framework for analyzing the evolution of perspectives on sex work (Kuhn et al., n.d.). The traditional paradigm of criminalization has given way to a new understanding that frames sex work as legitimate labor deserving of rights protections (Van der Meulen, 2012).

This shift challenges long-standing societal prejudices and advocates for decriminalization and comprehensive labor protections (Asad, n.d.). As Kuhn's framework suggests, this transformation requires substantial reforms in policy, law enforcement, and social attitudes to create more equitable conditions for sex workers' political participation (Van der Meulen, 2012).

Political Economy of Sex Work and Democratic Engagement:

Economic marginalization, as documented by Ahuja and Chhibber (2012), significantly impacts political engagement among vulnerable populations, including sex workers. Their research reveals that economically marginalized groups often view voting as their primary connection to the state.

The political economy of sex work in India is characterized by significant power imbalances that directly impact political participation. These include economic dependencies on brothel owners, local politicians, and police that create complex patronage relationships (Shah, 2014).

The COVID-19 pandemic exposed the precarious economic position of sex workers. As Seshu (2021) documents, many sex workers faced severe financial hardship during lockdowns, with limited access to government relief programs.

Digital Citizenship and Technology Access:

Access to digital technology and digital literacy skills have become essential prerequisites for full citizenship (Baruah et al., 2020). Research reveals significant digital divides affecting sex worker communities in India, creating substantial barriers to accessing online government services and political information.

The "Locked Out at the Margins" (2020) report documents how digital exclusion creates new forms of marginalization for sex workers in an increasingly digital democracy. At the same time, digital technologies present new opportunities for political organization and advocacy, allowing sex workers to engage in advocacy while protecting their privacy (SANGRAM, 2018).

Conclusion: Toward an Inclusive Democratic Framework:

This comprehensive literature review reveals the complex interplay of factors that shape sex workers' political participation in India. While significant barriers remain, emerging research highlights the agency and resilience of sex worker communities in claiming political voice despite systemic exclusion.

Moving forward, scholars emphasize the need for a multidimensional approach that addresses both structural barriers and individual capabilities. This includes legal reforms, technological initiatives to bridge digital divides, capacity building to enhance political literacy, and cultural interventions to address stigma.

As Fraser's justice framework suggests, meaningful inclusion requires addressing both redistributive claims (economic justice) and recognition claims (cultural justice) to create conditions for participatory parity in democratic life.

By centering sex workers' experiences and perspectives in policy discussions, India has the opportunity to deepen its democratic promise and create more inclusive political institutions that recognize the citizenship rights of all members of society.

Perspectives from the field.

Life in Sonagachi: Stories of Survival, Struggle, and Hope from India's Largest Red-Light District.

In the heart of Kolkata, Sonagachi's narrow bylanes tell a story of contrast and complexity, where daily life unfolds in unexpected ways. Within its vibrant streets, women create pockets of normalcy - mothers tend to their children, neighbours chat while chewing betel leaf, and a distinct community persists despite its identity as a red-light district. The social hierarchy is starkly visible in its architecture: from the air-conditioned Nilkomol (Blue Lotus) building housing higher-paid workers to the cramped, modest brothels reflecting economic vulnerabilities.

The human stories from these lanes are particularly poignant. There's Subhadra, now 65, whose trembling hands and tear-filled eyes tell of a life that began here at age six when she was abandoned. Today, without documentation or family, she faces her twilight years in desperate circumstances, unable to access government support. Her plea - "Please, ask the government to help us. We might just die like this" - echoes the desperation of many elderly sex workers.

In contrast, another elderly woman's story offers hope - her children's success enabled her retirement, and her voter card became a symbol of citizenship, allowing her to participate in democracy and access welfare schemes. The younger generation's stories reveal an ongoing struggle: Savitri at 36, still working but lacking documentation; Phool and Jhilmil, who have voter cards but whose days are consumed by constant work; and Lakshmi, whose official documents can't shield her from society's stigma.

The most pressing challenge these women face is the crisis of identity documentation. Without proper papers, they struggle to access basic services - banking, healthcare, housing, and government support remain out of reach. The situation becomes particularly dire with age,

creating a vicious cycle of exclusion that perpetuates through generations. Many can't prove their age, birthplace, or even their existence in official terms.

Organizations like the Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC) work to create support networks and advocate for change. Their membership cards, costing Rs. 110 per year, offer a potential solution as possible ID proof, though broader policy reforms are needed to address the community's comprehensive needs.

Through these lanes of Sonagachi, every story - whether of tragedy or triumph - reminds us that behind every statistic are real women with real lives, dreams, and struggles. Some find paths to dignity, others remain trapped in cycles of vulnerability, but all share the fundamental human desire for recognition, respect, and the right to exist with dignity in their own country.

(Names have been changed to protect privacy)

Electoral Inclusion Initiatives for Sex Workers in Sonagachi: A Multi-Level Implementation Analysis.

Insights from State and District Election Offices.

The electoral machinery at both state and district levels in Kolkata has implemented a comprehensive strategy to ensure electoral participation of sex workers in Sonagachi. The Chief Electoral Officer's office leads with sustained community engagement and targeted interventions, facilitating registration through local NGOs and organizing special registration camps within the community. Their structured Turnout Implementation Plan (TIP) provides a framework for monitoring registration progress and identifying participation gaps, while gender-sensitive infrastructure on voting days includes separate queues for women voters and crèche facilities.

At the district level, the North Kolkata office tackles complex challenges in identity verification and documentation, particularly crucial given the diverse geographical backgrounds of community members from Nepal, Bangladesh, and Myanmar. Working closely with organizations like Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC), they've implemented a minimal documentation approach to make the process more accessible. The SVEEP program has been innovatively deployed through engaging activities like Rangoli competitions and "Chunav Pathshalas," creating a more welcoming electoral environment.

Both offices have established model polling booths featuring women officers and essential facilities, demonstrating their commitment to creating an inclusive voting environment. The systematic approach to voter registration maintenance and regular updating of voter ID cards addresses the challenge of frequent resident movement within the community. Despite persistent challenges of social stigma and access issues, the collaborative efforts between election officials and NGOs have shown promising results, as measured through voter turnout percentages and registration completion rates. This multi-level approach showcases how administrative machinery can adapt and respond to the unique needs of marginalized communities while maintaining electoral integrity.

Insights from Booth Level Officers (BLOs).

BLOs have adapted documentation requirements to accommodate the unique circumstances of sex workers, accepting self-attested copies of address proof and implementing Form 8 for multiple purposes. They address mobility challenges by facilitating voter card transfers for community members with dual residences. Door-to-door surveys form the backbone of their inclusivity drives, complemented by digital literacy initiatives. BLOs have innovatively integrated electoral awareness programs with local festivals, particularly during Durga Puja, to create positive associations with the electoral process.

Chunav Pathshala Initiative.

The recent Chunav Pathshala sessions conducted, represent a significant step in electoral awareness. These educational sessions, held at three locations in Sonagachi, focused on demystifying the electoral process and providing information about voter registration procedures. BLOs offered detailed explanations about various electoral forms (Forms 6, 7, and 8) and documentation requirements. While the initiative faced challenges with attendance, recommendations for improvement include creating a more festive atmosphere, using vernacular language in promotional materials, and developing a structured approach to regular sessions. The initiative demonstrates the election machinery's commitment to inclusive democracy while highlighting areas for continued improvement in reaching marginalized communities.

The Transformative Impact of DMSC in Sonagachi: A Community Empowerment Initiative.

The Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC) stands as a pioneering organization led by former sex workers in Sonagachi that has transformed into a powerful agent of social change. At its core, DMSC operates across multiple crucial domains, implementing comprehensive programs that address the complex needs of the sex worker community. Their work encompasses rights advocacy and empowerment, focusing on building unity and leadership while raising awareness about labour rights within the community. A significant achievement has been their success in helping sex workers establish legal identities through documentation support, including the groundbreaking recognition of "sex work" as a valid occupation.

The organization's reach extends deep into social welfare integration, effectively connecting workers with various government schemes and benefits that provide financial security and healthcare access. Their health initiatives have been particularly impactful, covering everything from HIV/AIDS prevention to COVID-19 management and mental health support. DMSC has also established a robust anti-trafficking program, creating a comprehensive safety net for vulnerable workers through vigilance and rehabilitation support.

What sets DMSC apart is their innovative approach to community development. Through their partnership with Usha Cooperative and SBI, they've pioneered community banking initiatives that promote financial inclusion and independence. Their education programs serve both children and adults, creating pathways for personal growth and alternative income generation. Perhaps most notably, they've successfully transformed the historically tense relationship between sex workers and law enforcement through established communication channels and rights awareness programs.

The impact of DMSC's work resonates across individual, community, and systemic levels. At the individual level, sex workers have gained enhanced self-esteem, financial independence, and access to social security. The community as a whole has developed a stronger collective voice, experiencing improved living conditions and reduced violence. At the systemic level, their advocacy has led to significant policy changes and increased legal recognition for sex workers. Despite facing ongoing challenges in documentation, social integration, and economic security, DMSC continues to evolve and adapt its approach. Their success in integrating sex workers with mainstream society while preserving their dignity serves as a model for similar interventions globally, demonstrating how grassroots organizations can effectively drive sustainable social transformation.

<u>Results & Discussions: Electoral Participation and Barriers in Sonagachi's Sex Worker</u> <u>Community.</u>

The research findings reveal complex intersectional barriers to electoral participation among sex workers in Sonagachi, with documentation challenges emerging as the most significant obstacle. Through our mixed-methods analysis, several key patterns emerged regarding electoral inclusion and systemic barriers faced by the community.

The physical and social infrastructure of Sonagachi reflects stark economic hierarchies that directly impact electoral participation. Our observations revealed that workers in better-equipped facilities, such as the air-conditioned Nilkomol building, generally had higher rates of documentation and electoral participation compared to those in more modest accommodations. These disparities highlight how economic vulnerability compounds challenges to political participation.

Documentation emerged as a critical barrier, with many respondents lacking basic identity proof required for voter registration. The case of Subhadra, a 65-year-old resident who entered the community at age six, exemplifies the severe implications of documentation gaps. Without proper identification, she and others like her remain unable to access not only voting rights but also essential government welfare schemes. This documentation crisis creates a cycle of exclusion that particularly affects aging sex workers, who find themselves increasingly vulnerable without access to social security benefits.

The electoral machinery's response to these challenges has been notably proactive, though with varying degrees of success. The Chief Electoral Officer's office has implemented a comprehensive Turnout Implementation Plan (TIP), including specialized registration camps and gender-sensitive infrastructure. Booth Level Officers (BLOs) have adapted documentation requirements to accommodate the community's unique circumstances, accepting self-attested copies and implementing flexible procedures. The Chunav Pathshala initiative, while facing attendance challenges, represents an innovative approach to electoral education within the community.

The Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC) has emerged as a crucial intermediary in facilitating electoral participation. Their membership cards, costing Rs. 110 annually, have

become an alternative form of identification, though their acceptance varies across institutions. DMSC's broader advocacy work has contributed to significant policy changes, including the recognition of "sex worker" as a valid occupation, which has implications for documentation processes.

Success stories from the community demonstrate the transformative potential of electoral inclusion. Several respondents who obtained voter cards reported increased access to government schemes and a stronger sense of citizenship. However, these positive outcomes are tempered by persistent challenges, as exemplified by cases like Savitri (36) and others who continue to work without proper documentation despite ongoing initiatives.

Our analysis indicates that while targeted interventions by electoral authorities and NGOs have made progress, sustained systemic changes are needed to address the intersectional vulnerabilities that continue to limit electoral participation among sex workers in Sonagachi. The findings suggest that successful electoral inclusion requires a comprehensive approach that addresses both immediate documentation needs and broader socio-economic barriers.

Concluding Remarks.

This research illuminates the complex interplay between gender, occupation, and democratic participation in India's largest red-light district, revealing both persistent challenges and promising pathways toward electoral inclusion. The findings underscore how the intersection of gender and occupational stigma creates unique barriers to political participation for sex workers in Sonagachi, while also highlighting the transformative potential of targeted interventions and community-led initiatives.

The documentation crisis emerges as the primary obstacle to electoral participation, creating a cyclical pattern of exclusion that particularly affects the most vulnerable members of the community. However, the innovative approaches adopted by electoral authorities and grassroots organizations like DMSC demonstrate that these barriers are not insurmountable. The success of initiatives such as the Turnout Implementation Plan and Chunav Pathshala, despite their limitations, suggests that targeted interventions can effectively enhance electoral participation when designed with sensitivity to the community's unique circumstances.

The stark economic hierarchies within Sonagachi, reflected in its physical infrastructure, reveal how socio-economic vulnerabilities compound challenges to political participation. This

finding emphasizes the need for interventions that address not only immediate documentation needs but also underlying economic disparities. The contrasting experiences of residents in facilities like the Nilkomol building versus those in more modest accommodations highlight how economic security can significantly influence access to democratic processes.

The role of DMSC as an intermediary organization has proven crucial in bridging the gap between the community and electoral systems. Their holistic approach to community development, combining practical support with advocacy for systemic change, offers a model for similar interventions in other marginalized communities. The organization's success in securing recognition of sex work as a valid occupation represents a significant step toward dismantling structural barriers to political participation.

Looking forward, this research suggests that sustainable progress in electoral inclusion requires a multi-faceted approach that combines immediate practical interventions with long-term systemic change. Future policy initiatives should focus on streamlining documentation processes, enhancing economic security, and addressing societal stigma. The experiences documented in Sonagachi offer valuable lessons for promoting electoral inclusion among marginalized communities more broadly, while highlighting the ongoing need for sustained engagement and reform in India's democratic processes.

Ultimately, this study demonstrates that the path to genuine democratic inclusion requires not only institutional reforms but also a fundamental shift in how society views and values its most marginalized members. The stories of triumph and struggle from Sonagachi's lanes remind us that behind every statistical measure of electoral participation lies the fundamental human right to dignity and democratic representation.

References:

- Varshney, A. (1998). India Defies the Odds: Why Democracy Survives. Journal of Democracy, 9(3), 36–50.
- Lijphart, A. (1996). The Puzzle of Indian Democracy: A Consociational Interpretation. *The American Political Science Review*, 90(2), 258–268. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/2082883</u>
- Guha, R. (2002). Democracy's Biggest Gamble: India's First Free Elections in 1952. World Policy Journal, 19(1), 95–103.

- Green, J. E. (2008). Max Weber and the Reinvention of Popular Power. *Max Weber Studies*, 8(2), 187–224.
- Ahuja, A., & Chhibber, P. (2012). Why the Poor Vote in India: "If I Don't Vote, I Am Dead to the State". *Studies in Comparative International Development*, 47(4), 389–410. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s12116-012-9115-6</u>
- 6. Varshney, A. (2014). Battles Half Won: India's Improbable Democracy. Penguin UK.
- 7. Banerjee, M. (2017). WHY INDIA VOTES? ROUTLEDGE.
- 8. Dahl, R. A. (1971). Polyarchy: Participation and Opposition. Yale University Press
- 9. Kuhn, T. S., Marcum, J. A., & Baylor University. (n.d.). Thomas S. Kuhn (1922-1996).
- Srivastava, K. (2024). The health risks for women in surrogate motherhood: Insights from an ethnographic study in Anand and Gurugram, India. In *Handbook on sex gender and health* (pp. 1–21). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-19-9265-0_13-1
- International Transport Workers' Federation. (2019). Ending Violence at Work. *Economic* & *Political Weekly*, *LIV*(24), 320–322.
- Alliance, I. H. (2016b). Behavioral Tracking Survey (FSW & High-Risk MSM)-III-2014 (By Alliance) [Dataset]. In Harvard Dataverse. <u>https://doi.org/10.7910/dvn/pdfbry</u>
- Kotiswaran, P. (2019). Has the Dial Moved on the Indian Sex Work Debate? In *Alternative Standpoint: Vol. LIV* (Issue 22, pp. 10–11).
- 14. Seshu, M. S. (2021). Locked Down: Sex Workers and Their Livelihoods. In *Economic and Political Weekly* (Vol. 56, Issue No. 11). <u>https://www.epw.in/engage/article/locked-down-sex-workers-and-their-livelihoods</u>
- 15. Locked Out at the Margins. (2020). Economic & Political Weekly, IV(30), 8.
- Azhar, S., Dasgupta, S., Sinha, S., & Karandikar, S. (2020). Diversity in Sex Work in India: Challenging Stereotypes Regarding Sex Workers. *Sexuality & Culture*, 24(6), 1774–1797. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-020-09719-3
- Dash, S., & Nakkeeran, B. (2020). Sex Workers and Misrepresentations. In Economic & Political Weekly, *Economic & Political Weekly: Vol. IV* (Issue 43, pp. 58–59).
- Panigrahi, A., & Panigrahi, A. (2023). Suffrage in Shackles: A Case for Enfranchising Prisoners in India. In Economic & Political Weekly, *Alternative Standpoint* (pp. 10–11).
- FROM THE EDITOR'S DESK. (2022). Voting as a Moral Act? In *Economic & Political Weekly: Vol. IVii* (Issue 50).

- Mukhopadhyay, R. (2006). Anthropology in the Margins of the State. In V. Das & D. Poole (Eds.), *Economic and Political Weekly* (pp. 3510–3511) [Book]. Oxford University Press.
- 21. Singh, V. P. & CWDS. (2022). Judicial Approaches to the Criminalisation of Marital Rape. In *Indian Journal of Gender Studies* (Vols. 29–1, pp. 10–32). CWDS. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/09715215211056791</u>
- Van Der Meulen, E. (2011). Action research with sex workers: Dismantling barriers and building bridges. *Action Research*, 9(4), 370–384. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1476750311409767</u>
- 23. Baruah, P., Akruti Ramchandran, & Raja Venkata Krishna Dandamudi. (2020). Devaluing Dignity: Three Risks of Dignity Inflation in the Indian Supreme Court's Reasoning. In *Economic & Political Weekly: Vol. IV* (Issue 31, pp. 33–34) [Journal-article].
- 24. Rao, N., Gavai, B. R., Bopanna, Supreme Court of India, Ganga Harjivandas, & Sanjay Leela Bhansali. (2022). *Recognition of Sex Workers' rights by the Supreme Court of India*.
- 25. Das, V., Poole, D., & Stevenson, L. (2007). Anthropology in the Margins of the State. In *Political and Legal Anthropology Review* (Vol. 30, Issue 1, pp. 140–144). <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/24497674</u>
- 26. Shankar, V. K., & Sahni, R. (2021). Sex Work, Sex Trafficking, and Myopia of the State. In Saheli, Mazhe Maher, Rescue Foundation, Symbiosis School of Economics, Pune, Department of Economics, Savitribai Phule Pune University, Pune, & Women and Child Development Commissionerate, Government of Maharashtra, *Economic & Political Weekly: Vol. IVi* (Issue 43, pp. 53–54).
- Lerum, K. & Brents, B. G. (2016). Sociological Perspectives on Sex Work and Human Trafficking. *Sociological Perspectives*, 59(1), 17–26. https://doi.org/10.1177/0731121416628550
- Weitzer, R. & Department of Sociology, George Washington University, Washington, DC 20052. (2009). Sociology of Sex Work [Review]. *Annu. Rev. Sociol.*, 213–234. <u>https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-070308-120025</u>
- 29. Annavarapu, S., & Levenson, Z. (2021). The Social Life of the State: Relational Ethnography and Political Sociology. *Qualitative Sociology*, 44(3), 337–348. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11133-021-09491-2</u>
- Srivastava, I. D., & Majhi, P. (2022). The Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act: The Problems. In International Journal of Law Management & Humanities & VidhiAagaz,

International Journal of Law Management & Humanities (Vol. 5, Issue 5, pp. 851–859). https://www.ijlmh.com/

- Van Der Meulen, E. (2012). When Sex is Work: Organizing for Labour Rights and Protections. *Labour/Le Travail*, 69, 147–167. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/24243929</u>
- 32. Asad, T. (n.d.). Where Are the Margins of the State? *Copyrighted Material*, 279–282. https://www.sarpress.org
- 33. Berg, H. (2014). Working for Love, Loving for Work: Discourses of Labor in Feminist Sex-Work Activism. *Feminist Studies*, 693–721. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.15767/feministstudies.40.3.693</u>
- Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color. In *Stanford Law Review* (Issue 6, pp. 1241–1299). Stanford Law Review. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/1229039</u>
- 35. Hornset, N., & De Soysa, I. (2021). Does Empowering Women in Politics Boost Human Development? An Empirical Analysis, 1960–2018. In *Journal of Human Development* and Capabilities [Journal article]. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/19452829.2021.1953450</u>
- 36. News18. (2019, October 7). Why Soil from Brothels is Used to Make Goddess Durga's Idols. <u>https://www.news18.com/news/india/durga-puja-2019-why-is-soil-from-brothels-used-to-make-the-goddess-idols-2331645.html</u>
- 37. Rights of sex workers: Should prostitution be legalised? (2014, December 7). The Economic Times. <u>https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/magazines/panache/rights-of-</u> sex-workers-should-prostitution-be-legalised/articleshow/45397117.cms?from=mdr
- 38. NANDINEE BANDYOPADHYAY. (n.d.). International Union Rights, 2005, Vol. 12, No.4, Sex Workers Organizing (2005), pp. 12-1. *International Centre for Trade Union Rights*.
- 39. ANNOUNCEMENT OF SCHEDULE FOR GENERAL ELECTIONS TO LOK SABHA AND LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLIES OF ANDHRA PRADESH, ARUNACHAL PRADESH, ODISHA & SIKKIM, 2024. (n.d.). https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=2015227
- 40. Time Capsule. (2023, July 15). *The Sad History Of Bangladesh Prostitution Villages* | *Documentary* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wvl6yia58ZY
- 41. Kurup, S. (2006, July 8). A Rajasthan village where prostitution is tradition. *The Times of India*. <u>https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/a-rajasthan-village-where-prostitution-is-tradition/articleshow/1717444.cms</u>
- 42. https://www.mea.gov.in/Uploads/PublicationDocs/184 india-dynamic-democracy.pdf

- 43. Ghosh, S. (2023, January 8). Exploring Prostitution in Ancient India: A Subversion of Contraries. Dhaara. <u>https://dhaaramagazine.in/2023/01/15/exploring-prostitution-in-ancient-india-a-subversion-of-contraries/</u>
- 44. Ali, P., & Rogers, M. M. (2023). *Gender-Based Violence: A Comprehensive Guide*. Springer Nature.
- 45. Feminist Perspectives on Sex Markets (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy). (2020, October 6). https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/feminist-sexmarkets/#ShouSomeSexMarkProh
- 46. Amnesty International (2016). AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL POLICY ON STATE OBLIGATIONS TO RESPECT, PROTECT, AND FULFIL THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF SEX WORKERS. In AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL POLICY IN BRIEF. <u>https://www.amnesty.org.uk/files/pol3040622016english-1.pdf</u>
- 47. Council of Europe. (2024, February 22). Protecting the human rights of sex workers. Commissioner for Human Rights. <u>https://www.coe.int/en/web/commissioner/blog/2024/-/asset_publisher/aa3hyyf8wKBn/content/protecting-the-human-rights-of-sex-workers</u>
- 48. Human Rights Council, Working Group on Discrimination Against Women and Girls, Radačić, I., & United Nations. (2023). Eliminating discrimination against sex workers and securing their human rights. In *Working Group on Discrimination Against Women and Girls* [Guidance Document].

https://documents.un.org/doc/undoc/gen/g23/241/61/pdf/g2324161.pdf

Appendices.

Snapshots from the field:



Fig.1. Fostering informed citizenship and democratic engagement in Sonagachi through Chunav Pathshala and Voter Awareness Drive.



Fig.2. Organizing a Voter Registration Camp in Sonagachi to empower citizens and promote democratic participation.



Fig.3. A selfie corner at a model polling station adds a touch of fun to the voting experience during the 2024 Lok Sabha Elections.



Fig.4. Sonagachi gears up for Rangoli Competition, festive fun, and Voter Registration Drive.



Fig.5. Highlighting the creative potential of the community members of Sonagachi.